What political parties say and what they do: Manifestos and Performance

Researched by Hassan Nabi Dar

About IPR
Institute for Policy Reforms is an independent and non-partisan think tank established under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance. IPR places premium on practical solutions. Its mission is to work for stability and prosperity of Pakistan and for global peace and security. IPR operations are supported by guarantees from the corporate sector.

Contents:

1. Voters Beware 3
2. Macro-Economy 7
3. Development 13
4. Tax Reforms 22
5. Energy 25
6. Social Development and Poverty Alleviation 32
7. Agriculture 55
8. National Security, Foreign Policy, and Law and Order 60
9. Bibliography 70
The goal of this study is to objectively inform how each political party performed during the last five years. The study aims merely to capture performance of each political party that formed the federal or provincial government in Pakistan during 2013-2018. We have tried to do so accurately without endorsing or favouring any party or position. In doing so, we rely solely on data available, usually from government sources. There is no attempt here to judge a party. As an independent and non-partisan institution IPR does not take sides.
Political parties release their manifestos with much fanfare and hoopla. Looking at their performance though, it is right to question if the celebration is justified. IPR has conducted a study to assess how much each party has delivered on the promises made in their manifestos 2013.

Our research shows that the manifestos mostly seem forgotten once elections are over. If the parties were serious, manifesto ideas must translate to policies, programmes, and projects soon after assumption of power. But as the Charts and Tables on the following pages show, we see little evidence of that. They achieved a small part of what the manifestos set out to do.

It is not clear also if parties are realistic in announcing their promises. There is no evidence to suggest that they relate manifesto ideals to available financial and institutional resources. Nor did we find them to budget for their agendas or dwell on the capacity of organizations expected to deliver the targets. Consequently, once in power, the parties make scant effort to monitor progress.

This document studies manifestos of the three political parties that formed federal and provincial governments, PML N, PPP, and PTI. Their manifesto promises are tabulated and juxtaposed with actual performance. To facilitate comparison, IPR researchers have quantified manifesto statements to the extent possible. Each party’s performance is distributed into three categories: progress, mixed performance, and underperformance. The set of first pie charts below shows how the three parties did overall when we count all their promises against what they got done:
Overall PML N, with governments at the Centre and the Punjab province, achieved 29% of the total promises made in the manifesto. PPP and PTI achieved 29% and 23%, respectively. No party even delivered one-third of the total manifesto targets. We may remember that some of the activities were part of government’s day to day function. So, delivery in such cases was not because of implementation of promises but in normal course of execution. This modest performance should surprise no one. It shows that once elected, political parties seldom refer back to what should be their lodestone.
In itself, each manifesto comes out as a thoughtful and comprehensive document. It is hard to argue with much of what they propose. Yet there are a couple of quibbles. For example, there is no information in any manifesto about the way they identify the country’s needs. Resultantly, they read as prescriptive musings of wise party officials who know best what is good for the people.

We also do not see a strategy in the manifestos nor an effort to prioritize. Given resource constraints, it is improbable that any government can deliver on the whole menu of proposals that each manifesto contains. A governance strategy helps decision makers prioritize and sequence. It also manages citizen expectations. At present, manifestos offer a cafeteria of choices with something to suit each taste.

In some cases, one part of the manifesto does not tie with another. For example, one manifesto headlines sustainable and inclusive economic growth, yet its human development section does not sufficiently deal with skills training and literacy of the large reserve of young Pakistanis outside the school system. All manifestos promised major new services for the people and yet proposed reduction in current expenditure.

Most manifestos have sections on job creation. Yet government data on labour is often questioned for reliability. Nor do governments announce how many jobs were created each year. Recall the economic and social implications of an estimated two million young Pakistanis entering the job market each year. The manifestos also profess many kinds of governance reforms such as civil service, police, and land reforms, without reference to political appetite or capacity for them. All commit also to a devolved local government. It is no secret that very little was done in these areas and in the case of local government, some parties did the opposite of what their manifestos said.
Also, none of the parties tried to make their manifesto a peoples’ document. There was no effort for example to engage with communities and NGOs to design plans to meet the social deficit or for urban development.

The following pages contain topics with Tables and Charts showing performance of the three parties along several dimensions.
MACRO-ECONOMY

Macro-economic policy is mostly the preserve of the federal government. However, through their revenue collection effort, development programmes, other initiatives, and institutional effectiveness, provinces too have more than a minimal role. For example, in the last two fiscal years, provinces contributed to overall fiscal deficit by running up their own deficits. Provinces also pledged to increase revenue. Below is the performance on macro-economic policy by each Party. Their macro and micro-decisions affect GDP growth.

Pakistan Muslim League N

PML N’s well written manifesto is a credible economic revival plan. Yet, once in government the Party gave scant attention to translate the manifesto ideals into policies and programmes. Reading it in retrospect makes it seem as a wish list because so little was done. In fact, it was possible to achieve many of its stated objectives. In pursuing economic revival, the document rightly states that Pakistan must “create several mutually reinforcing engines of growth”. Among them, are the country’s physical and human resources, technological potential, sound macro-economic policy to reduce the twin deficits and increase investment, and economically stimulating infrastructure. As the Chart shows, the Party achieved 30% of its goals and none that was transformational to put the economy on a path of sustained growth. In fact, in some areas such as fiscal deficit and government debt, government achieved the opposite of what it had intended to do.

PML N Performance in Macro-Economy
# PML N Macro-economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in base year 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.</strong> Double GDP growth rate from 3% to 6% in the next 5 years</td>
<td>National GDP grew by 3.6%&lt;sup&gt;1&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>GDP growth rate reached 5.8%&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2.</strong> Increase investment (% of GDP) to at least 20%</td>
<td>Investment (% of GDP) FY 13 at 14.9&lt;sup&gt;3&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>Marginal growth, despite CPEC. Investment (% of GDP) FY 18 16.9&lt;sup&gt;4&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3.</strong> Bring inflation rate under 7 - 8%</td>
<td>Average inflation rate at 7.3%&lt;sup&gt;5&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>Average inflation during last five years recorded at 5.5%&lt;sup&gt;6&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.</strong> Limit government borrowing.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Public debt/GDP, 63.3%</td>
<td>i. Public debt, 71.3% of which, Ext debt, 21.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. of which, Ext debt, 18.8%</td>
<td>ii. Government debt 67.9%&lt;sup&gt;8&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. Government debt, 60.4%</td>
<td>iii. Interest paid June 2017, Rs. 1,350 Billion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv. Interest paid June 2013: Rs. 990 Billion&lt;sup&gt;7&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<sup>3</sup> Ibid

<sup>4</sup> "Pakistan: Inflation Rate From 2012 To 2022 (Compared To The Previous Year)”. Statista, Last modified 2018.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid


<sup>7</sup> SBP Annual State of the Economy Report FY 13, Chapter 6, Page 84, Table 6.1. Interest paid June 2017, MoF data

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.</strong> Decrease tax rates.</td>
<td>Tax slabs were reduced to 5% but income that exceeded the basic exemption limit (Rs. 400,000) was charged at a higher rate. Four income tax slabs with rates ranging from 5% to 15% were created for salaried filers. The basic exemption limit was increased to Rs. 1,200,000. Furthermore, in these five years, greater reliance was placed on indirect taxes, which became a source of burden for the poor.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6.</strong> Budget deficit will be lowered to 4%.</td>
<td>Budget deficit was at 6.3%. Budget deficit may exceed 6.5%.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7.</strong> One-third reduction in current expenditure.</td>
<td>Current expenditure for FY 13 was 2,625 Billion. No reduction. Despite drop in inflation, federal current expenditure grew each year. For FY 17, it was Rs. 3,494 Billion, 33% higher in four years.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8.</strong> Increase Tax-to-GDP ratio to 15%.</td>
<td>Tax to GDP ratio stood at 8.5%. Tax-to-GDP ratio improves to 12.5%.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

13 THE EXPRESS TRIBUNE > BUSINESS, Budget deficit widens to Rs2.1tr, far exceeding FY18 target, June 14, 2018
PPP Macro-economy

In line with the party’s traditional ideals, the PPP manifesto 2013 focuses on reducing social deficit and empowering all Pakistanis. The Manifesto is big on the right buzzwords. In the area of economic policy, it prioritizes inclusive and equitable growth, with high emphasis on jobs, poverty alleviation, and growth in agriculture productivity. It secondarily targets industrial growth, prioritizing SMEs and operation of SEZs. Although, the PPP did not form the federal government, the manifesto’s target growth rate of 8% by 2018 is an important benchmark for the PPP government to achieve in Sindh. If most of the stated goals, especially with regard to agriculture and industry, were achieved, Sindh’s economic growth rate of 4.2% would have been closer to the target of 8%. As the chart below shows, PPP did not achieve a single measure it set out to achieve.

---

PPP Macro-economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Aim to raise average growth rate 8% by 2018</td>
<td>Annual growth rate 1.9%&lt;sup&gt;18&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Annual growth rate 4.2&lt;sup&gt;19&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ensure that inflation is kept at 6-8%. (Though inflation is a Function of monetary policy and fiscal deficit)</td>
<td>Major cities in Sindh endured higher rate of inflation as compared to cities in other provinces&lt;sup&gt;20&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Sindh’s capital city has low rate of inflation as compared to other cities in the province but at 2.1% as of 2016&lt;sup&gt;21&lt;/sup&gt; Mostly because of monetary policy and low spending.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PTI Macro-economy

PTI’s economic policy emphasizes self-reliance in public finance and investment. A major goal for PTI was to reduce rural poverty. Consistent with this goal, its manifesto prioritizes growth in agriculture productivity. It pledged therefore to spend 65% of ADP on agriculture and rural development. It secondarily prioritized industry, especially SMEs. PTI too targeted a GDP growth rate of 7% by the end of five years. PTI planned also to cut non-development expenditure. If PTI had achieved the targets it set in the manifesto for agriculture, industrial, and institutional reforms, the provincial GDP could have grown by the targeted 7% growth.

---


# PTI Performance in Macro-Economy

![Pie Chart](chart.png)

## PTI Macro-economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Achieve 7% growth rate.</td>
<td>Annual growth rate of 4.9%&lt;sup&gt;22&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Annual growth rate of &gt;5.1%&lt;sup&gt;23&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Substantially increase total revenue.</td>
<td>Total revenue receipts: Rs. 245,925.6 million&lt;sup&gt;24&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Total revenue receipts: Rs. 470,854.4 million&lt;sup&gt;25&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reduce non-developmental government expenditures.</td>
<td>Total Current Revenue Expenditure for 2012-13 was Rs. 195 Billion&lt;sup&gt;26&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>Total Current Revenue Expenditure for 2016-2017 was Rs. 339 Billion&lt;sup&gt;27&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


DEVELOPMENT

Under development, this document aggregates all economic growth drivers such as infrastructure development, industrial and agricultural revival, credit for private sector, institutional reforms that lower cost of doing business, technology upgrade, trade agreements, and logistics improvement.

PML N

That political parties do not take their own manifestos seriously is confirmed by PML N government’s approach to development. Curiously, for example, soon after the PML N government was in place in 2013, the Planning Commission began work on a new long-term plan, Vision 2025. Few gave thought to operationalizing the economic plan in the manifesto. Nor were many important activities listed in the manifesto considered for implementation. The manifesto recommends public-private partnerships for infrastructure development. It proposes to establish a Bureau of Infrastructure Development to oversee private participation. It vowed to begin a Fund for subscription by overseas Pakistanis to ensure that foreign remittances translated into investment capital. None of these goals were met. Its plans for restructuring of PSEs or eliminating off-budget circular debt also never saw the light of day. One argument in the Party’s favour is that throughout the five years it had to battle hard with Black Swan events.

The manifesto is big on governance reforms. This document includes it in the Development chapter as it is an effective way to reduce cost of doing business and stimulate economic activity. For governance reforms, the manifesto highlights an active parliament guiding policy and providing oversight. The manifesto also commits strongly to local government with devolved political, administrative, and fiscal authority. Action on ground show, that clearly, these were not the leadership’s priority. The manifesto also recommends an ambitious policy for Science and Technology. During the five years, this area did not even receive lip service.

The Chart below shows that PML N performed 11% of the promised activities.
### PML N Development

#### Major Manifesto Pledge 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reform state owned enterprises to reduce loses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many state-owned enterprises performing under loss(^28).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSEs continued to underperform without any effort to restructure or reform them. According to IMF, no change in conditions, as the combined accumulated loss of public sector enterprises have exceeded Rs 1.2 trillion, 4% of GDP(^29).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2. Increase growth rate in industrial sector to 7-8%.

According to National Accounts following were growth rates:

i. Industrial sector 4.3%.
ii. Manufacturing 3.5%.
iii. LSM 4.26%.
iv. SMEs 8.2%.

According to National Accounts following were growth rates:

i. Industrial sector 5.8%.
ii. Manufacturing 6.24%
iii. LSM 6.13%
iv. SMEs 8.2%

No serious effort to diversify and upgrade manufacturing.

3. Industrial parks will be developed, especially in under developed areas.

Provinces being encouraged by Federal Government to establish industrial zones in collaboration with Small Industries Development Boards and Corporations to promote SMEs.

Industrial Estates/Special Economic Zones and investment opportunities are part of China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC). It is still work-in-progress.

4. Initiate large-scale infrastructure projects.

Projects were initiated to repair roads, construction of small dams and an underpass railway crossing at Gujar Khan, but not large-scale in nature.

Several large-scale projects initiated including under CPEC which involves the construction of motorways and rail sector projects.

5. Technology Up-gradation Fund will be established to support new investments.

Technology up-gradation fund announced by each government every year but not implemented.

As done before, Technology upgradation fund was again established in 2016 to facilitate textile sector and exports. Allocated Rs. 6 billion. However, no details or evidence available to show whether this fund has been utilized.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Establish an Equity Fund to bring together public and private sector organizations.</td>
<td>None existed</td>
<td>No steps taken to establish an equity fund.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Create economic clusters for industries.</td>
<td>Few industrial clusters in place but were underperforming&lt;sup&gt;36&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Routine progress. SMEDA implemented some projects for common facilities&lt;sup&gt;37&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>An Export-Import bank (EXIM) will be set up.</td>
<td>Export-Import bank considered but never established.</td>
<td>Export-Import bank incorporated in 2015, but still is not functional&lt;sup&gt;38&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Multinational Corporations (MNC’s) in Pakistan will be encouraged to expand their production facilities.</td>
<td>MNC’s were encouraged to invest and expand in Pakistan&lt;sup&gt;39&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Some MNC’s set up production facilities in Pakistan&lt;sup&gt;40&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pakistan Peoples Party: Development**

The PPP manifesto 2013 promises infrastructure for the future. In keeping with the manifesto’s preference for high sounding phrases, it says that “The future of this country lies in modern technology for growth and social justice”. Yet Sindh saw no progress in this regard. The government did very little to deliver on the manifesto’s promise for “software parks” and “bridging the digital divide”. Sindh announced several urban planning projects. While Sindh government claims substantial progress, newspapers report a number of challenges, Sindh government has clarified. “Sindh has not been a leader when it comes to development spending”, says one newspaper<sup>41</sup>, though there is evidence that this has changed in FY 18.

---


<sup>41</sup>Business Recorder, Sindh: big on infrastructure, 9 June 2017
Regardless, the infrastructure deficit will take time to fill whether in urban development, ‘harnessing modern technology’, or meeting SDGs. With PPP’s traditional focus on poverty alleviation, especially in the rural areas, delivery on irrigation and water storage projects have been better, yet behind the extensive promises in the manifesto. Political polarization too has hobbled progress in Sindh, especially in urban areas. Here, even some of the municipal functions have been centralized leaving dysfunctional delivery.

Sindh government’s publications show that delivery fell short of promise\textsuperscript{42}. Agriculture production has grown moderately, while industrial production has declined. Data published by Sindh government is available up to 2016. Unless there is a major turnaround since, there has not been any major progress in providing Sindh residents ‘infrastructure of the future’.

To reduce cost of doing business and stimulate economic activity, the manifesto pledges to improve support for businesses, especially SMEs. It also focuses on specific sectors such as textiles, banking, and trade. According to World Bank’s (sub-national) Doing Business Report, Sindh cities lag among thirteen selected Pakistan cities. Karachi ranks 9, Sukkur 7, and Hyderabad 13. We clarify that there are questions about the frequency with which WB collects data, which often lag by some years.

## PPP Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in base year 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Establish Software/IT parks</td>
<td>No efforts taken to establish industrial parks within the province.</td>
<td>MoU signed with China in 2016 for IT/Software park in Sindh&lt;sup&gt;43&lt;/sup&gt; No progress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Focus more on infrastructure programmes.</td>
<td>Infrastructure in Sindh facing decay; dilapidated roads and poor sanitation and education infrastructure&lt;sup&gt;44&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>Minimal effort. Some road projects in Karachi city. Green line project started by fed gov behind schedule. Rest of Sindh minimal progress on infrastructure projects despite announcement of many large schemes&lt;sup&gt;45&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Create special economic zones (SEZs) to facilitate FDI.</td>
<td>Full implementation of Special Economic Zone Act, proposals to establish three industrial zones.</td>
<td>Setting up of economic zones announced. No progress including those under CPEC project&lt;sup&gt;46&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Reduce the cost of doing business in the province.</td>
<td>Reforms under consideration to make Sindh more business friendly.</td>
<td>Sindh cities have low ranking in World Bank’s Doing Business Report. Of 13 Pakistan cities, Karachi ranked 9&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Hyderabad 13&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; and Sukkur 7&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


Pakistan Tehreek i Insaf Development

PTI’s manifesto highlights institutional and constitutional reforms including police and civil service as well as land reforms. It was a strong advocate of local governments. For economic revival, its focus is on sustainable public finance with low fiscal deficit and reduction in government debt. The manifesto also targets industrial and agriculture growth. Within manufacturing it prioritizes SMEs. The manifesto is also big on rural development and alleviation of rural poverty. The manifesto planned to facilitate credit for SMEs and to ensure that government provide services to support businesses. As with other parties, its performance was mixed.

### PTI Development

**Major Manifesto Pledge 2013**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position in base year 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Bring forth rapid industrial growth.</td>
<td>(2011-12) 2,299 Industrial units, out of which 1,821 were functional and 478 were closed.(^{47})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Underperformance</th>
<th>Mixed performance</th>
<th>Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Allocate 65% of ADP funds for agriculture and rural development.</td>
<td>Rs. 1,060 million allocated for Agriculture, 1.2% share of ADP(^{49}).</td>
<td>Rs. 3,039.4 million allocated for Agriculture, 2.32% share of ADP(^{50}). Allocation of ADP for rural development not mentioned in ADP 2017-2018(^{51}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Special focus will be given to industrial estates.</td>
<td>10 small industrial estates (SIE) were functional(^{52}).</td>
<td>Number of SIEs remain the same(^{53}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Encourage the setting up of Business Support Services (BSS) Providers in the private sector.</td>
<td>No major step taken to encourage setting up BSS providers in the private sector.</td>
<td>KP Industrial Policy formulated in 2016 that stressed the importance of BSS providers(^{54}), but still no known progress made.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Encourage creation of linkages between SMEs and large businesses to ensure markets for their goods.</td>
<td>Routine progress made by SMEDA.</td>
<td>No progress in province.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Launch campaign that promotes forestation</td>
<td>No serious efforts taken to promote forestation.</td>
<td>A project to plant 'Billion' trees successfully launched throughout KPK(^{55}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Eliminate Timber Mafia and ensure transfer of economic benefits to the local inhabitants from legal logging.</td>
<td>Timber Mafia was active and routinely involved in illegal logging.</td>
<td>Though some steps have been taken to reduce illegal logging, it is still very common and timber mafia is still active in the region.(^{56})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


| 8. | ‘National’ Public parks will be set up across the province. | No plans to create large scale parks. | Creation of four ‘National’ level parks was announced in 2016, to provide eco-tourism, green jobs and preserve natural beauty under the Asia Protected Area Partnership (APAP) partnership\(^5\). Progress uncertain. |

---

TAX REFORMS

One area where each government performed well was increase in tax collection. The federal government of PML N also introduced an open tax culture, by issuing yearly tax directories. Yet, tax policy largely stayed untouched, until the end of the PML N government’s term when it announced the Tax Amnesty Scheme. The scheme can be considered a reform only if it achieves its stated goal of increased documentation.

Two areas were of concern. To control fiscal deficit, federal government frequently banked on indirect taxes: higher GST and regulatory duty. Apart from being iniquitous, they dampen demand. Also, the provinces stayed especially delinquent in not tapping into agriculture tax or recovery of assessed levies on agriculture. Agriculture contributes 20% to GDP, yet tax collection from it is 0.0003% or close to nothing.

The Chart and Table below give the federal government’s performance under PML N. Provinces too increased collection. These are shown in the Tables under macro-economic indicators.
# PML N Tax Reforms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To achieve greater equity in the tax system by increasing dependence on direct taxes.</td>
<td>Very low direct tax collection, which resulted in greater reliance on indirect taxes.(^{58}).</td>
<td>Tax system still not progressive, contribution of direct shows no change. There was some reduction in federal revenue from indirect taxes from 64% in FY 13 to 60% in FY 17. The difference is because of administrative efficiency not from change in policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Broad base the tax system through greater use of an IT database.</td>
<td>IT database was under consideration.</td>
<td>Considerable administrative efficiencies created.(^{59}). Also, successful implementation of tax amnesty scheme will help broad base the tax system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Make reforms to reduce tax evasion</td>
<td>Tax amnesty schemes under consideration but never fully implemented.</td>
<td>Tax Amnesty scheme to bring more people into tax net, especially through rationalized tax rates. Administration efficiency also cubed evasion.(^{60}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. An annual tax directory will be published indicating the taxes paid and assessed in the last 3 years.</td>
<td>Annual tax directory was being formulated.</td>
<td>Annual tax directory issued.(^{61}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Underperformance:</th>
<th>Mixed performance:</th>
<th>Progress:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.</strong></td>
<td>Provincial governments will be asked to increase their own tax revenues to increase their contribution in overall taxation.</td>
<td>Provincial taxes amounted to Rs. 150,723 million during FY June-July 2012-2013, though collection of tax on agriculture still negligible.</td>
<td>Provincial taxes amounted to Rs. 279,971 million during FY July – March 2017- 2018, though collection of tax on agriculture still negligible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6.</strong></td>
<td>Simplify the administration of taxes and compliance especially for small businesses.</td>
<td>Under consideration but no major steps taken.</td>
<td>Significant efforts made.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

ENERGY

Energy was a subject that concerned all Pakistanis in 2013 and beyond and all manifestos cover the subject with considerable weight. Yet, what hobbles the energy sector are issues of policy and governance. These need holistic policy making, governance reforms, and administrative efficiency. The other issue affecting sustainable energy supply was cost and reliability of fuel supply. Generation capacity is one of many issues.

Energy PML N

The Party delivered on its promise to increase power generation in Pakistan. Installed capacity in 2013 was 22,812 MW. It increased to 29,573 MW by June 2017. Likewise, generation increased from 96,500 GWh in FY 13 to 117,300 GWh in FY 17\(^65\).

The party’s goal was to ‘modernize existing thermal units’, reform GENCOs, and attract FDI in power generation. For this, the manifesto planned to improve regulatory standards by reforming NEPRA. It planned also to upgrade distribution reliability and to improve governance to reduce line losses as well as ensure 100% collection of bills. A clear goal was elimination of circular debt. The PML N manifesto also dwells on reliable and lower cost fuel supply.

FDI in the power sector came from China, but in environmentally unfriendly coal fired plants. There was no effort to reform or modernize GENCOs. In fact, rehabilitation of Nandipur ended up in very high escalation in cost and technical challenges that hampered production\(^66\). As the Table below shows, weak DISCO performance continued to retard the power supply chain. Circular debt continued to grow. Rather than reform regulation and ensure its independence, government increased its functional supervision of NEPRA.

The manifesto’s target for reducing cost of energy and increasing reliability needed institutional and incentive support for higher domestic production. Overall, gas production fell in the country between FY 16 and FY 17\(^67\). The new power plants are based mostly on imported coal. LNG import was government’s other major initiative for reliable supply. It added to external dependence and as fuel its full cost impact is yet to be known. Consequently, it is not surprising that the party achieved only 20% of its total planned activities in the energy sector.

\(^{65}\) MoF, Pakistan Economic Survey 2017-18, Appendices Table 14.2, Page 168


\(^{67}\) OGRA Petroleum Industry Report 2016-17, Pages 47 to 50.
## PML N Energy

### Major Manifesto Pledge 2013

| Creation of a Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources through the merger of Ministries of Water and Power and Petroleum and Natural Resources. |

### Position in 2013

- Ministry of Water and Power, Petroleum and Natural Resources were working as independent ministries.

### Position in 2018

- New Federal Ministry of Energy, with two constituent divisions — Power Division and Petroleum Division.

### Initiate reforms in National Electric Power Regulatory Authority (NEPRA)

- No major efforts or initiatives taken to reform or revamp the system.

### Position in 2018

- NEPRA’s autonomy as independent institution compromised after Council of Common Interests (CCI) approved drastic amendments that would force NEPRA to follow government directives while determining electricity tariff\(^{68}\).

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Reforms to be Made</th>
<th>Progress to Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Distribution Companies (DISCOs)</td>
<td>Distribution companies were underperforming. No efforts made as DISCOs are still underperforming with minimal improvement in line losses and under-recovery of bills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Transmission and Distribution losses will be brought under 10%.</td>
<td>Total line and distribution losses GWh/% in PEPCO system was 18.59% and 28.37% for K-Electric. No improvement. Total Line Losses GWh/% in PEPCO system at 18.53% and 25.66% for K-Electric till 2016.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Collection of electricity bills will be brought as close to 100%.</td>
<td>Collection of electricity bills at a loss 10.5%. Some improvement. Collection of electricity bills at a loss of 5.52%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Introduction of prepaid billing system to improve bill collection and reducing bad debts.</td>
<td>No prepaid billing system in place. Routine continuation of Project to initiate ‘smart meter’ systems throughout Pakistan, but suffered many delays. Need to change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Permanent elimination of circular debt.</td>
<td>Circular debt stood at Rs. 503 billion on May 31. Circular debt has increased to Rs. 977 billion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Reforms of Oil and Gas Regulatory Authority (OGRA)</td>
<td>No major reforms proposed for OGRA. Government ministers assured reforms yet again in 2016, but no progress visible.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


70 ibid

71 ibid


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Underperformance:</th>
<th>Mixed performance:</th>
<th>Progress:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Rationalization of energy tariffs in line with international prices across all fuels.</td>
<td>Electricity tariffs higher as compared to rates assigned to neighboring countries(^78)</td>
<td>Despite reduction in FAC, Pakistan tariff highest in region(^79).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Aggressive wellhead pricing for Oil and Gas exploration companies in order to substantially increase production of oil and gas.</td>
<td>Routine exploration and prices in place.</td>
<td>No change in policy. In fact, greater reliance on imported energy. Some progress made in Sindh(^80).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Develop a consensus between Federal and Provincial Governments to initiate more hydropower projects.</td>
<td>No consensus achieved on major hydropower projects such as Kalabagh dam.</td>
<td>Yet no consensus developed. Consequently, no progress on major projects and no major initiative begun. Several projects under construction and feasibility studies being carried out for more projects. However, progress is still slow.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Increase reliance on renewable energy, such as solar, wind and etc.</td>
<td>Minimal reliance on renewable energy.</td>
<td>Pakistan’s energy mix features 64% thermal, 30% hydel, 3% nuclear and the remaining 3% for renewable energy(^81).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Import of gas through pipelines will be given top priority.</td>
<td>Import of gas was facilitated mainly through sea-route. In order to relieve reliance on ships, gas pipeline project with Iran was finalized.</td>
<td>Although import of gas supply has increased, but is being transported primarily through ships. Furthermore, gas pipeline projects with Iran at standstill.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


14. Underperformance

Expeditious setting up LNG import terminals.
LNG projects were not implemented despite foreign companies showing interest\(^{82}\)
Two LNG terminals successfully established\(^{83}\) and one more approved for initiation in 2018\(^{84}\).

15. Mixed Performance

Development of Thar coal fields
Projects for coal fields in Thar were finalized, but never fully implemented.
Thar coal field projects initiated through CPEC, mining work in progress\(^{85}\).

PPP Energy

Manifesto 2013 promised massive increase in generation capacity, nationally. It highlights that during 2008-13, the PPP government “enabled provincial governments to set up power plants in the private sector”. But we see limited, if any, progress, in provincial government’s generation. Increase in capacity has come from federal government’s framework. The manifesto further goes on to target ‘run of the river’ hydro generation. There is no evidence that such a project was launched in Sindh province. Similarly, no initiative began in Sindh for energy conservation. There are news reports of wind power projects in Sindh initiated by the provincial government.

## PPP Energy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Give more priority to renewable energy</td>
<td>Shifting towards renewable energy was under consideration but never acted upon by provincial government.</td>
<td>WAPDA with Sindh Energy Department. $200 million loan from World Bank for renewable energy project. Two wind power plants were to start producing electricity in Sindh by end 2017. Wind Turbine in Jhimpir has started to produce energy since May, 2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Initiate power projects that will generate up to 12000 MW of electricity.</td>
<td>Several small power projects under consideration.</td>
<td>Most new projects under federal framework. Projects initiated under CPEC and IPPs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Build run-of river projects</td>
<td>Not under consideration at provincial level</td>
<td>No run of river project begun in Sindh</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PTI Energy

The PTI manifesto prioritizes sustainable power generation. In the context of provincial responsibility, it focuses on renewables, especially, wind and solar energy for increase in power generation. There has been some movement on relatively small renewables.

---

## PTI Energy

### Major Manifesto Pledge 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Bring load shedding to manageable proportions urgently.</th>
<th>Load shedding exceeded more than 8 hours on a daily basis.</th>
<th>No realistic change as load shedding still persists.(^9)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Electricity &amp; Gas shortages to be eliminated within PTI’s first term of government</td>
<td>Electricity shortages witnessed during summers and gas shortages during winters.</td>
<td>Gas and electricity shortages still a major issue within the province.(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Divert all resources to maximizing energy production</td>
<td>Energy production was not up to the mark.</td>
<td>Various projects were launched in power sector to produce 1200 MW of electricity by June 2018(^3).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Chapter 6

SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT AND POVERTY ALLEVIATION

All manifestos gave high importance to meeting the social deficit gap and to poverty alleviation. PML N proposed a new social contract with human resource development as an engine of growth. It considered knowledge as the main input for creating a modern growth economy and to build international competitiveness of our products in the world market place.

Equity and poverty alleviation is a traditional PPP declared priority. Its manifesto is oriented to meet these goals. According to the manifesto, economic growth too is the means for equitable distribution and inclusion of all segments of the country. In addition to education and health, PPP also focuses on Labour Reforms.

For PTI also, exit from poverty is a priority. Within this, it focuses on rural poverty, though its manifesto includes the urban poor. The means of meeting these goals are through higher public spending on agriculture and rural development, increasing allocations for education and health.

The three parties each prioritized education in their programmes. Education is a provincial subject. With importance given by each manifesto, there was expectation of robust performance.

This chapter will focus on promises made by each party for education and health. There are individual party commitment to labour and land reforms, also shown below.

PML N Education

The PML N manifesto professes that education should “become number one national priority” and must reflect in “financial allocations, institutional reforms, effective implementation”. The manifesto refers to education as a key driver of socio-economic development to meet the demands of a modern economy. It lists several measures and initiatives in pursuit of these goals (discussed in the Table below).
### PML N Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Commit 4% of GDP to education.</td>
<td>2.14% of GDP was allocated for education(^94).</td>
<td>2.5% of GDP was allocated for education(^95).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Bring adult literacy rate to 80%</td>
<td>Adult literacy rate at 60%.(^{96})</td>
<td>Adult literacy dropped to 57%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Increase Gross Enrollment Rate (GER) at primary level.</td>
<td>GER at primary level stood at 86%(^{97}).</td>
<td>GER at primary level stood at 97%(^{98}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{94}\) With Only 2.1Pc Of The GDP, Pakistan Spends Lowest On Education In South Asia - Data Stories", Data Stories, Last modified 2016, https://www.datastories.pk/with-only-2-1pc-of-the-gdp-pakistan-spends-lowest-on-education-in-south-asia/.


\(^{98}\) Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Underperformance</th>
<th>Mixed Performance</th>
<th>Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>National literacy movement will be launched.</td>
<td>No national literacy movement launched.</td>
<td>Still no plans to launch a nationwide literacy programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>A vision 2025 for Pakistan’s education system shall be formulated.</td>
<td>No long-term vision or Plan in place.</td>
<td>Vision 2025 for Pakistan was launched, but it is not education specific. No evidence of effort to operationalize the Vision.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Introduce a uniform system of education.</td>
<td>Establishment of “National Curriculum Council” under consideration.</td>
<td>The National Curriculum Council established (NCC) and approved its first ever National Curriculum Framework, but no serious action to bring a uniform system of education.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Laptops will be distributed amongst students in universities on the basis of merit.</td>
<td>Laptop Scheme was already in place in Punjab.</td>
<td>PM’s National Laptop Scheme Introduced by Federal Government with initial 100,000 Laptops distributed. Plans to distribute 500,000 laptops by 2020100.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>HEC will be given greater financial resources.</td>
<td>In 2012-13, Federal PSDP allocated Rs. 15.590 billion for HEC. Used amount was Rs. 10.278 billion101.</td>
<td>In 2017-18, Rs. 35.662 billion allocated for HEC out of which Rs.19 billion was used102.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Develop a national strategy for skill-based uniform curriculum in order to meet the changing requirements of the economy.</td>
<td>No serious effort in place.</td>
<td>No progress made for skill-based uniform curriculum.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Underperformance:</th>
<th>Mixed performance:</th>
<th>Progress:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Promote a ‘reading culture’, by developing libraries at national, provincial and district level.</td>
<td>No serious efforts taken to develop libraries or promote reading at national level.</td>
<td>Rs.60.188 million allocated for the Department of Libraries. Establishment of Digital Information Division to promote ‘reading culture’ through e-learning. E-libraries established in 20 districts in Punjab&lt;sup&gt;103&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Danish schools will be set up in all provinces.</td>
<td>Establishment of Danish schools started since 2010.</td>
<td>Danish schools only exist in Punjab.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Education Endowment funds will be set up in all provinces to award merit scholarships to poor and needy students for higher education.</td>
<td>Education endowment fund existed in Punjab since 2009.</td>
<td>150,000 students provided scholarships on basis of merit&lt;sup&gt;104&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>The standards in universities shall be raised to transform them into world class universities.</td>
<td>Three Pakistani universities among Asia’s top 200&lt;sup&gt;105&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>Pakistan highest ranking university, Quaid-i-Azam University ranks #79 in Times Higher Education Asia rankings, but overall standards remain the same as once again only three Pakistani universities among Asia’s top 200&lt;sup&gt;106&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Special education institutions shall be expanded to enable special children to attend schools.</td>
<td>No especial incentives, though some institutions existed for many years.</td>
<td>135 special education institutions set up throughout Punjab in 2017.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PPP Education

PPP too placed high importance on education from relating it to its goal of poverty alleviation and equal opportunity. The manifesto reminds the reader that education is part of the Party’s basic principles and one of its central pillars. It also considers education important for tolerance and stability of society. PPP manifesto targets financial allocation for education at 4.5% of GDP. The Party’s performance falls short of its lofty ideals. Several indicators validate the finding. They include indicators pertaining to access to education, literacy rate in the province, condition of schools and provision of basic facilities. The Party achieved 20% of the many measures listed in the manifesto.

PPP Education

PPP Education

PPP Education

Major Manifesto Pledge 2013 | Position in 2013 | Position in 2018
--- | --- | ---
1. Revise curriculum to reduce hate and bigotry. | According to National Commission for Justice and Peace, 12% of the content from the curriculum was discriminatory in nature.¹⁰⁷ | No effort made to revise the curriculum, despite several assurances from various government and party officials.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.</th>
<th>Provide education for all to eliminate class divides</th>
<th>Sindh Assembly passes free education bill(^{108}), but never fully implemented.</th>
<th>No progress as number of total children out of schools have increased(^{109})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Initiate reforms in madrassas and shutdown those that preach extremism.</td>
<td>Process to register all Madrassas across the province under consideration.</td>
<td>Geo-tagging of 7,724 madrassas completed in Sindh(^{110}). Over 2000 unregistered madrassas shutdown(^{111}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Initiate a comprehensive curriculum reform.</td>
<td>No concrete steps taken to initiate reforms of curriculum.</td>
<td>Sindh School Education Standards and Curriculum (SSES&amp;C) Bill-2014 passed; in an effort to reform the curriculum and content being taught to students(^{112}). However, despite the bill, five-member committee was constituted by CM Sindh in 2018 to further improve education standards as the state of education in Sindh was not improving(^{113}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Allocate 20% of budget for education.</td>
<td>Allocated 19.27% of total budget(^{114})</td>
<td>Allocated 20% of budget(^{115}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


\(^{115}\) ibid
PTI education

In 2013, PTI’s goal was to launch an “education revolution” to promote universal literacy. It also targeted to raise the standard of education. Its mission was also to reduce the gap in quality between private and public schooling. Education budget was to incrementally grow to 5% of GDP. PTI’s performance too, was mixed.

---

**PTI Education**

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Immediately repair and improve the conditions of government schools.</td>
<td>2687 schools taught their students under open sky.¹¹⁶</td>
<td>483 schools still teaching students under the open sky¹¹⁷.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


### 2. Increase spending on education.
- Allocated Rs. 16,356.1 million, 18.5% share of ADP.
- Total spending on education sector was Rs. 11,225 Million, 5.7% of current spending.\(^{118}\)
- Allocated Rs. 27,033.7 million, 15% of ADP.
- Total expenditure on education sector was Rs. 27,555 Million, 7.1% of current account spending.\(^{119}\)

### 3. Focus on adult literacy rate.
- Adult literacy rate at 50%. Total number of Colleges/Universities: 278, with an enrollment of 216,352 students.\(^{120}\)
- Adult literacy rate at 53%. Total number of Colleges/Universities: 299, with an enrollment of 267,822 students.\(^{121}\)

### 4. Increase number of Government Schools.
- Total number of government schools in KPK: 27,456.\(^{122}\)
- Total number of government schools in KPK: 27,262.\(^{123}\)

### 5. Improve female literacy rate.
- Female literacy rate 33%\(^{124}\)
- Female literacy rate 35%\(^{125}\)

### 6. Provide free education to girls and boys up to Matric.
- Initiatives taken in the past to provide free education in government schools, but never fully implemented.
- Bill passed in 2017 on providing free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 16\(^{126}\). (Still under implementation)

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Establish a comprehensive monitoring system in the education sector.</th>
<th>Routine monitoring.</th>
<th>Introduction of an Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU) to track the performance of all government schools. Rs. 600 million allocated.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Place emphasis on teacher training by setting up standard facilities in all districts to ensure the availability of local teachers.</td>
<td>No specific programme to enhance teacher training.</td>
<td>MoU signed with British Council to improve teaching standards at primary schools across KPK in 2016. Reported effort made by provincial government standards, though allegations of mismanagement and inefficiencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Sports and extra-curricular activities will be encouraged.</td>
<td>Constructed 45 sports grounds and more than 100 schools were provided sports facilities.</td>
<td>More than 5,000 schools provided with sports kits. 180 sports grounds created.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Health

Despite commitment expressed by each party, health indicators did not see sizable improvement. The sector stayed neglected mostly.

PML N

The PML N manifesto 2013 recognized that the sector’s delivery system was “extremely inadequate”. The manifesto targets public health spending of 2% of GDP by 2018. The manifesto rightly accords “high priority to preventive health strategy” to minimize costs. It promised also a national health service across Pakistan. An insurance scheme, initially targeting the most vulnerable, was to provide coverage of up to Rs. 150,000 per annum. The extensive measures that were to support these aims could not be achieved perhaps because the plan does not include a sustainable financial model. Also, across party lines, social sector has not been the leadership’s priority. It is not surprising that PML N government achieved a small part of what it set out to do.

## PML N Health

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Increase spending on health to at least 2% of GDP.</td>
<td>National public health expenditure 0.35% of GDP&lt;sup&gt;135&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
<td>National public health expenditure still less than 1%&lt;sup&gt;136&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ensure 100% vaccination and immunization.</td>
<td>Pakistan still one of the three remaining countries that has yet to eliminate polio virus transmission.</td>
<td>Significant immunization deficit remains&lt;sup&gt;137&lt;/sup&gt;. Polio near elimination&lt;sup&gt;138&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A new National Health Insurance Scheme will be introduced for the whole of Pakistan, which shall cover the most vulnerable poorest segment of the population. It will include a National Health Insurance card which will allow citizens to avail basic healthcare in a government hospital or by a general practitioner at concessional rates.</td>
<td>No National Health Insurance scheme in place.</td>
<td>No efforts to introduce a 'National Health Insurance Scheme' and other said initiatives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Existing Basic Health Units (BHUs) will be strengthened.</td>
<td>No major efforts taken to upgrade BHUs.</td>
<td>As of 2017, 284 BHU’s were not operational due to lack of doctors&lt;sup&gt;139&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Health PPP

PPP manifesto 2013 gives very high importance to health. Under the title of Health for All, it shared the party’s belief that “access to quality health services is the right of each individual”. Provincial governments were to achieve this goal. Underlying this emphasis, the manifesto sets a nationwide allocation target of 5% of GDP for health. Through “better governance and transparent” use of funds, PPP was to “bring about a revolution in health care”. The plan was to strengthen three flagship health programmes: LHWs, mother and child health, and immunization. IPR estimates that the provincial government achieved 25% of its targets.

---

PPP Health

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Reduce population growth rate to 1.6%</td>
<td>Census 1998 showed Sindh had a population of 30.44 million, with an average annual growth rate of 2.8%.(^{144})</td>
<td>Census 2017 showed Sindh had a population of 47.8 million, with an annual growth rate of 2.41%.(^{145})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Implement an accelerated family planning programme to reduce population growth rate.</td>
<td>No major efforts taken to initiate family planning programme, and Contraceptive Prevalence Rate (CPR) in Sindh stood at 13.62%.(^{146})</td>
<td>CPR increases to 25.0% in 2016(^{147}), with the aim of increasing to 45% by 2020(^{148}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{145}\) ibid
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Increase number of health care facilities and doctors.</td>
<td>Total number of hospitals in Sindh were 485, with 27201 beds. Patients per doctor: 2986&lt;sup&gt;149&lt;/sup&gt;. Total number of Hospitals in Sindh (2016) 648, with 30126 beds. Patients per doctor: 3159&lt;sup&gt;150&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Create special departments or units to deal exclusively with preventive health care and medicine.</td>
<td>Creation of special departments was being considered. The following special programmes of Sindh Health Department have achieved progress: Dengue Control and Prevention Program&lt;sup&gt;151&lt;/sup&gt;, Blindness Control Program&lt;sup&gt;152&lt;/sup&gt;, Hepatitis Free Sindh Program&lt;sup&gt;153&lt;/sup&gt;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Strengthen programmes that deliver on the ground, including LHW programme.</td>
<td>No major reforms or initiatives to upgrade the system. Sindh government launches major upgrade to health worker curriculum a move aimed at enhancing the quality of door-to-door preventive healthcare services delivered by lady health workers (LHWs)&lt;sup&gt;154&lt;/sup&gt;. But progress made through these initiatives is still uncertain.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Underperformance:</th>
<th>Mixed performance:</th>
<th>Progress:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. Merge polio eradication, routine vaccination, LHWs, mother and child care, malaria and hepatitis control, and family planning to create a consolidated and coordinated public health programme.</td>
<td>Polio and other health care programmes working independently.</td>
<td>As of 2018, no merger has taken place to create a consolidated public health programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Eradicate polio from the province.</td>
<td>30 cases reported.</td>
<td>Only one polio case reported in 2017.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Reduce water scarcity and provide clean drinking water to all.</td>
<td>Water scarcity and contaminated water a major issue for residents in Sindh.</td>
<td>No effort made to alleviate the issue of water scarcity and contaminated water. According to Sindh’s Minister of Health, Sikandro Mandro, the province is facing a water shortage of 60%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Deploy mobile health units.</td>
<td>Mobile health units existed but were not part of government initiatives.</td>
<td>Rs. 1.6 billion allocated by Sindh government for mobile healthcare unit project. Several mobile health units offering free medical care in rural Sindh.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ensure that 100% of infants and children under 5 years are vaccinated. Less than 30% of children immunized\(^{160}\) As of 2018, less than 50% of children immunized coverage due to lack awareness and education\(^{161}\).

Establish specialist medical care facilities including trauma centres, cardiac and nephrology centers at local level. Feasibility studies were being carried out. Specialist medical care facilities such as trauma\(^{162}\) and cardiac centers created\(^{163}\), but not on local/district level\(^{164}\).

Introduce accountability of health care providers through patient charters and complaint redress systems. Complaint redress system was being formulated. Complaint redress system in place for Health Department of Sindh\(^{165}\), but no information available regarding how effective this redress system is.

Health PTI

Under its slogan of “healthy people, healthy nation”, the PTI manifesto 2013 includes several important reforms. Important among them are to double the envelope for public spending on health, 100% immunization, universal access to drinking water, and improved sanitation, reduce infant and under-five mortality, and several more (see Table). PTI achieved 29% of its health targets.


\(^{164}\) "PPP Says No To District Trauma Centres - The Express Tribune". The Express Tribune, Last modified 2017. https://tribune.com.pk/story/1368023/ppp-says-no-district-trauma-centres/.

### PTI Health

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Substantially increase spending on Health Sector.</td>
<td>Allocated Rs. 5,736.1 million, 6.51% of ADP. Total expenditure on health sector was Rs. 7,646 million, 9.06% of total revenue expenditure.</td>
<td>Allocated Rs. 16,474.7 million, 9.15% of ADP. Total expenditure on health sector was Rs. 26,897.9 million, 6.93% of total revenue expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Launch public awareness campaigns on population welfare to reduce population growth rate to 1.6%.</td>
<td>Estimated population in KPK (last census was held in 1998: 26,792,000. Annual growth rate of 2.81%).</td>
<td>Census 2017 showed that KPK had a population of 30,523,371. Annual growth rate of 2.89%.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

168 ibid
### Underperformance:

- **3.** Ensure free primary health care for the poor.  
  - Free treatment only limited to heart patients.\(^{169}\)

  ‘Sehat Sahulat Programme’ (SSP) formulated to provide free health care. SSP launched in January 2017 with the goal of providing free treatment to people holding ‘Sehat Insaf Cards’ in 110 hospitals. There is an annual limit of Rs. 540,000\(^{170}\) per family for medical treatment and medicines. Despite allegations that several public sector hospitals in the province were initially unwilling to implement the program\(^{171}\), the SSP is a major step towards bringing equity in medical care system\(^{172}\).

### Mixed performance:

- **4.** Increase the number of Basic Health Units (B.H.Us)  
  - Total number of functional B.H.Us was 785\(^{173}\).  
  - Total number of functional B.H.Us was 765\(^{174}\).

- **5.** Achieve 100% immunization of children against preventable diseases.  
  - Less than 50% coverage of immunization.  
  - 54% of coverage for routine immunization throughout the Province\(^{175}\).

---


\(^{175}\)
6. Ensure access to clean drinking water.

Clean drinking water projects were launched, but mired by corruption scandals\(^{176}\).

Despite completing 140 projects to provide clean drinking water in 2016\(^{177}\), a report highlighted that 50% of diseases in KPK were caused because of consuming contaminated water\(^{178}\). In 2018, the Supreme Court (SC) was forced to intervene after a petitioner urged the SC to take action that would ensure clean drinking water\(^{179}\).

7. Improve access to sanitation and ensure better sewage and drainage schemes.

Lack of sanitation and drainage systems a major problem.

As of 2016 – 17, 80% of people in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have access to sanitation services with 74% in rural and 98% coverage in urban areas.


\(^{177}\) “KPK (KPK Govt Completes 140 Clean Drinking Water Schemes) | Pakistan Press International”. Ppinewsagency.Com, Last modified 2016. https://ppinewsagency.com/%E6%9C%89%E6%8E%A7%E4%B8%81%E6%89%8B%E7%83%88%E8%A3%85%E6%B0%91%E5%AD%90%E5%9B%BD%E8%AF%89%E5%8D%B7%E5%9D%80%E4%B8%89%E7%BB%84%E5%B7%A5%E6%8A%A5%E5%BC%8F%E8%A3%85%E6%B0%91%E6%96%87%E6%98%8E%E6%A8%A1%E6%8B%9F/.


### PPP Labour Reform

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Minimum wage will be increased to Rs. 18,000.</td>
<td>Minimum wage increased from Rs 8,000 to 10,000.(^{180})</td>
<td>Minimum wage increased to Rs 14,000(^{181}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. Bring forth much needed labour reforms. | Labour reform still under consideration. | First ever labour policy introduced in 2018 with the following salient features:  
   i. Coherent policy guidelines  
   ii. Contract labour system to be regulated  
   iii. Minimum wage council established to determine minimum wages for skilled and unskilled workers\(^{182}\). |

### Underperformance

#### 3. Provide two seats in provincial assembly to labour representatives.

- No representation of labourers in Provincial Assembly.
- Still no representation in Provincial Assembly. Though PPP parliamentarians proposed a bill in Parliament.  

#### 4. Enact special laws that will allow the establishment of trade unions for domestic workers.

- No trade union existed specifically for domestic workers.
- Law for legal recognition of home-based workers with right for collective bargaining as well as other protection passed by Sindh Assembly. However, GoS has yet to formulate rules to implementation of the law. No trade union exists for domestic workers.

#### 5. Construct a labour housing complex in the provincial capital.

- Construction of apartments for labourers was initiated, but the property was eventually occupied by land grabbers.
- Project for a housing complex for labourers initiated, but still uncomplete and mired by corruption allegations.

#### 6. Develop schemes through which 500,000 low-income houses will be constructed for the poor.

- 10,000 low income houses were created under the “Benazir Basti” programme.
- Failure to construct 500,000 low-income houses for the poor, several projects initiated but could not be materialized due to irregularities and corruption.

---


7. Increase the participation of women in the workplace and secure their rights by enforcing anti-discrimination and anti-harassment laws.
   Protection Against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Bill passed in 2012.
   No new bill passed.

8. Prevent child labour and rehabilitate child labourers
   Child labourers being used as part of the workforce.
   Sindh’s Labour Policy Act 2018 addresses the issue of bonded labour and the use of children as labourers. However, this policy still has not been fully implemented, especially in rural areas.

---

PTI Performance in Housing and Land Reform

- **33%** Underperformance
- **34%** Mixed Performance
- **33%** Progress

*Underperformance:*, *Mixed performance:*, *Progress:*
## PTI Housing and Land Reform

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Computerize land records</td>
<td>Land records were not computerized.</td>
<td>Decision to computerize land records was taken in 2014(^\text{188}). Slow progress.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AGRICULTURE

The provinces have a key role in agriculture growth. A key issue in agriculture is to raise productivity and provide water to all farmers through efficient management of water resources. Many other factors are important including seed quality, protection from virus, cost of input of both supplies and equipment, credit, and efficient markets. In effect, there has been limited progress. In FY 2015, agriculture production fell from previous years. Cotton production fell by 30%. Since then production has recovered though cotton has yet to reach the 2015 level.

PML N

The party’s manifesto aims to make agriculture “a fully viable economic industry by changing the policy framework and terms of trade”. Its target for incentives and facilities were small farmers. Its measures to achieve the goals are similar to those proposed by other parties, i.e. corporate agriculture, credit to farmers, production of high value crops for export, and efficient use of water. It also advocated land reforms to allot reclaimed land for landless farmers.

PML N Agriculture
## PML N Agriculture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Reform the agriculture credit system to ensure that at least 50% of the total is provided to small farmers</td>
<td>Routine system in place.</td>
<td>Some progress made in Punjab, where the government has undertaken initiatives to provide interest free loans to small farmers[^189].</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Convert Pakistan into a large net exporter of food and high value crops.</td>
<td>Food Group’s % share in total exports was 19.5 during July-May 2012-2013[^190].</td>
<td>No shift to high value crops. Food Group’s % share in total exports was 20.7% during July-April 2017-18[^191].</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Build consensus on the basis of the 1991 Water Accord to allow new water projects to be undertaken and extension of irrigation facilities to additional areas.</td>
<td>Failure to build national consensus that would allow new water projects; i.e Kalabagh Dam.</td>
<td>No new major water projects undertaken. Those that are under construction are in slow progress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Undertake immediate updating of revenue and property records using modern Information Technology.</td>
<td>Digitization of revenue and property records not yet implemented.</td>
<td>Significant progress in digitization of land records, especially in Punjab[^192].</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PPP Agriculture

In 2013, the PPP manifesto claims to put agriculture as a main focus of economic policy. It recognized not just that the sector contributed 20% to GDP, but also that it sustained 60% of the population. It sets again the target for providing crop insurance, setting cooperatives, and extending credit. The Peoples’ Agriculture Programme was to support especially farmers with less than 25 acres in holding. The means to achieve these goals is by modernizing and enhancing production and expansion of facilities. The party’s progress was mixed.

PPP Performance in Agriculture

PPP Performance in Agriculture

PPP Agriculture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Provide land to landless peasants and subsistence farmers with the eventual intent to create a network of small farm cooperatives.</td>
<td>55,000 acres of land was distributed in 17 districts to around 6,000 peasants – 4,800 women and 1,200 men. However, the land that was distributed was largely uncultivable.¹⁹³</td>
<td>‘Landless Harees Project’ had been launched in which a total of 41,520 acres were distributed to 4,103 beneficiaries across 17 districts. Efforts were also made by social mobilization teams working to create Co-operatives and community organizations across the province.¹⁹⁴</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 2. Introduce policy incentives to promote agro-industry in rural areas

- **No major policy incentives taken to promote agro-industry in rural areas.**
- **Sindh government has announced that it will introduce a new agriculture policy to attract domestic and foreign investors in rural areas through policy incentives.**

### 3. Provide agricultural subsidies at par with those in other countries in the region.

- **Routine progress was made.**
- **No progress until 2018. In the provincial budget for 2018-19, GoS has provided for subsidy of Rs. 9.6 billion on tractors, tube wells, solar pumps and other agriculture implements.**

---

**PTI Agriculture**

PTI’s manifesto refers to agriculture as the backbone of the economy. This importance aligns with the party’s aim to alleviate poverty as well as to generate rapid economic growth. Availability of water is an important growth input. The manifesto recommends storage dams as well as efficient use of water. From the long list of measures it planned to achieve these goals, the manifesto highlights major increase in ADP allocation, production of high value products for export, and computerized land records. PTI achieved 33% of its stated activities.

---

**PTI Agriculture**

![Pie chart showing Underperformance and Progress]

---


## PTI Agriculture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Revamp/ modernize Provincial Agriculture departments, connect them to Universities.</td>
<td>No major steps taken to reform the Provincial Agricultural departments.</td>
<td>KPK Agricultural Policy 2015 highlights the importance of revamping provincial agricultural departments; however, it does not mention any linkages with universities.¹⁹⁷ No information on its implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Storage facilities and infrastructure will be improved.</td>
<td>Routine maintenance, no efforts to enhance or improve conditions.</td>
<td>Despite claiming to improve storage facilities, farmers in KPK still have agricultural losses due to inadequate storage facilities.¹⁹⁸</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NATIONAL SECURITY, FOREIGN POLICY, AND LAW AND ORDER

PML N National Security

Underperformance: 43%
Mixed Performance: 43%
Progress: 14%
## PML N National Security

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Cabinet Committee on Defence and National Security will be formed, it will be headed by PM, and will be responsible for maintaining democratic oversight over matters such as foreign affairs, defence and national security policies.</td>
<td>National Security Council had been abolished since 2008(^{199}).</td>
<td>National Security Council (NSC) restored(^{200}). Headed by PM and is responsible for organizing policies on defence, national security, foreign affairs and improving coordination between civil and military institutions. As of 2018, a total of 23 NSC meetings have been held.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2.</strong> Highest priority to be given to strengthening the country’s Armed Forces.</td>
<td>Allocated Rs 545 billion for defence.(^{201})</td>
<td>Defence budget set at Rs. 1.1 trillion(^{202}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3.</strong> Ensure that all institutions, whether civil or military, act in accordance with the law, and under the supervision of the civilian government.</td>
<td>Civil-military relations relatively stable.</td>
<td>Reportedly, frequent civil-military friction(^{203}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.</strong> Integrating the Tribal Areas into country’s political mainstream.</td>
<td>Integrating FATA with KPK not under consideration.</td>
<td>Decision to merge FATA with KPK approved by CCI, Senate, Provincial and National Assembly(^{204}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


\(^{201}\) https://fp.brecorder.com/2012/06/201206291206845/.


### Underperformance

- **Offer negotiations and peace talks if terrorists are willing.**
  - No negotiations or process of reconciliation.
  - Terrorist attacks rampant within the country.

- **Create a robust counter narrative to defeat terrorism; use religious scholars to condemn terrorism and extremism.**
  - Use of religious scholars to condemn suicide attacks and violence against innocent civilians.

- **Ensure swift and speedy justice for the masses.**
  - More than 3 million cases pending over all\(^\text{209}\). No especial effort made by government made to reduce cost and time of litigation.

### Mixed Performance

- **Peace talks unsuccessful with Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and other affiliated groups.**\(^\text{205}\)
  - Full scale military operation launched in 2014. Major improvement in security in Pakistan\(^\text{206}\). Two successful operations have almost cleared the country of terrorism.

- **More than 1800 Pakistani Clerics issue Islamic decree condemning terrorism and extremism.**\(^\text{207}\)
  - However, extremist right-wing groups such as ‘Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat’, ‘Sipah-i-Sahaba’ and ‘Lashkar-e-Jhangvi’ still active and operate openly on social media\(^\text{208}\). Some of them have been cleared to participate in elections.

- **Over 1.8 million cases pending in Pakistan’s courts.**\(^\text{210}\)

### Progress

- **Peace Talks Between Pakistan And Taliban Collapse After Killings.** U.S., Last modified 2018.

  - [Link](https://nation.com.pk/06-Sep-2016/operation-zarb-e-azb-two-years-of-success)

- **More Than 1,800 Pakistani Clerics Issue Islamic Decree Condemning Terrorism.** VOA, Last modified 2018.
  - [Link](https://www.voanews.com/a/pakistan-clerics-islamic-decree-condemning-terrorism/4211204.html)

- **Banned Outfits In Pakistan Operate Openly On Facebook.** DAWN.COM, Last modified 2018.
  - [Link](https://www.dawn.com/news/1335561)

  - [Link](https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2013/02/08/over-3m-cases-pending-before-countrys-judiciary/)

- **Over 1.8 Million Cases Pending In Pakistan’S Courts.** DAWN.COM, Last modified 2018.
  - [Link](https://www.dawn.com/news/1384319)
## PML N Foreign Policy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The power to formulate and determine foreign policy will only be given to elected representatives.</td>
<td>Balanced formulation of foreign policy.</td>
<td>No Foreign Minister appointed for four years, Ministry of Foreign Affairs was under PM’s portfolio and his two advisors. Foreign Minister finally appointed in 2018. Reportedly, military influence over foreign affairs increased. Civil leadership did not create national consensus. Lack of direction and clarity especially regarding relations with India and Afghanistan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Further strengthen relations with proven and time-tested allies and normalize relations where there are differences.</td>
<td>Strengthened relations with China, UAE and Saudi Arabia, as well as USA. Effort to improve and normalize relations with Russia.</td>
<td>China-Pakistan relations solidified. Cooperation enhanced with Russia. Deteriorating relations with United States; US military aid to Pakistan suspended. Tension increased with USA and continued friction with India and Afghanistan (though some late improvement with latter).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

3. Increase economic ties with all countries in the world and powerful international economic blocks.

PM reiterates Pakistan’s position on Kashmir in the United Nations General Assembly. Stresses that issue of Kashmir cannot be sidelined.

4. Special efforts to be made to resolve the issue of Kashmir, advocate for the self determination of the Kashmiri people in international forums.

Pakistan becomes full member of SCO\(^\text{216}\), FATF has put Pakistan on ‘grey-list’; economic cooperation with international community can be jeopardized\(^\text{217}\). FTA talks with Iran stall\(^\text{218}\). Revised Pak-China FTA halted\(^\text{219}\).

PPP Performance in Law and Order

Underperformance: 0%
Mixed Performance: 25%
Progress: 75%

---


## PPP Law & Order

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Take action against any militant or terrorist organization that challenges the writ of state; use of targeted military operations to achieve these goals if necessary.</td>
<td>Targeted military operation led by Rangers approved in Lyari after consultation with Federal Government.</td>
<td>Despite a significant reduction in targeted killings and terrorist activity, both the Rangers and Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs) were unable to completely eradicate criminal and terrorist organizations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ensure protection and security to citizens from the threat of terrorism.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total number of fatalities in Sindh since from 2014 to 2018:**
- **1,285** civilians; **156** LEAs and **227** terrorists.

**Number terrorist attacks in Karachi since 2014 - 2018:** **1,982**

**Total number of casualties in Karachi since 2014 – 2018:**
- **2,157** killed, **1,146** injured.

---


223 Ibid
Underperformance: 25%
Mixed Performance: 0%
Progress: 75%

3. Drastically reduce street crimes in the provincial capital, Karachi.

More than 40,000 reported incidents of street crime and 2700 people killed. More than 20,000 reported incidents of street crime and 562 people killed.

4. Establish a witness protection programme for people who are providing information regarding militants.

Sindh Witness Protection Act, 2013 passed. Despite passing the Witness Protection Act in 2013, the provincial government was unable to provide adequate security to witness involved in high profile cases.

---


# PTI Law and Order

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Manifesto Pledge 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2013</th>
<th>Position in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bring an end to corruption by implementing the rule of law and ensuring that corrupt officials are held accountable.</td>
<td>Many concerns about corruption within the government.</td>
<td>Provincial accountability court called ‘Ehtasab Commission’ formed in 2015 to curtail corruption and bring accountability across the board. However, due to various amendments approved by the provincial cabinet, the commission became highly ineffective, which forced the Ehtasab Commission Chief to resign. Suspended 3 federal ministers belonging to Quami Watan Party (QWP) due to allegations of corruption. Coalition with QWP ended in 2017. 144 forest officials held over corruption charges in ‘Billion Tree Tsunami’ project. Initiated disciplinary action against 20 lawmakers for selling their votes during the Senate elections. Several allegations of corruption regarding CM Pervez Khattak.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Expected Outcome</th>
<th>Actual Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>NAB shall function under the administrative control of Judicial Commission</td>
<td>Provincial NAB in place.</td>
<td>No judicial commission in place. Provincial NAB chief was sacked by the provincial CM, who has several corruption allegations levelled against him.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Introduce reforms in the Police Department; will be independent and impartial.</td>
<td>No major reforms in Police Department.</td>
<td>KPK Police Act 2017 passed; provincial government claims that Police is now impartial and free from political interference. Under the new law, the IGP has been made an ex-officio secretary with total administrative, operational and financial autonomy. However, there is a clause that the provincial cabinet can initiate a case of premature transfer over unsatisfactory performance235. Furthermore, despite claims of being impartial and independent there have been instances where influential people involved in criminal activity were provided protection by the police; while denying justice to ordinary citizens236.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Support reforms that will allow a merger between FATA and KPK.</td>
<td>FATA merger with KPK was not under consideration.</td>
<td>Supported federal government in FATA- KPK merger and voted in favour of it in Provincial Assembly.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Underperformance:</th>
<th>Mixed performance:</th>
<th>Progress:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Provide security to ordinary citizens from the scourge of terrorism.</td>
<td>936 fatalities due to terrorist attacks in 2013 alone, out of which 603 were civilians, 172 law enforcement personnel and 161 terrorists.237</td>
<td>From 2013 to 2017, a total of 1127 fatalities occurred due to terrorist attacks. Out of which 660 were civilians, 238 law enforcement personnel and 229 terrorists.238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Take comprehensive steps towards abolishing Jihadi narrative by closing down financial channels that are funding militants and extremist ideology.</td>
<td>Financial channels for militant organizations active.</td>
<td>Allocated Rs. 300 million to Mulana Sami-Ul-Haq’s Madrassah, who is known to have links with the Taliban and other extremist organizations239.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Introduce a Dispute Resolution Council to resolve disputes through arbitration and mediation.</td>
<td>Plans for alternate dispute resolution under consideration.</td>
<td>Dispute Resolution Council (DRCs) established. A total of 5,753 cases were resolved through the use of DRCs from August 2014 to March 2016, almost 6,000 cases were resolved through mediation and settlements, while only 313 were referred to the courts.240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Initiate a process of de-weaponisation along with dissolution of militant wings in political parties.</td>
<td>De-weaponisation considered but never implemented.</td>
<td>No process of de-weaponisation has taken place.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

238 Ibid
240 Akbar, A. (2016). KP&#039;s Dispute Resolution Councils settled nearly 6,000 cases over the last six months. [online] DAWN.COM. Available at: https://www.dawn.com/news/1248887 [Accessed 28 May 2018].
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Finance.Gov.Pk, Last modified 2013,

3. Ibid
6. SBP Annual State of the Economy Report FY 13, Chapter 6, Page 84, Table 6.1. Interest paid June 2017, MoF data
12. THE EXPRESS TRIBUNE > BUSINESS, Budget deficit widens to Rs2.1tr, far exceeding FY18 target, June 14, 2018

Underperformance: 

Mixed performance: 

Progress: 


96. Ibid.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Underperformance:


152. ibid


Mixed performance:

Progress:
Underperformance: 

Mixed performance: 

Progress: 

http://puf.urbanunit.gov.pk/Presentations/Marquee%201/Day%202/02Khalid%20Mehmood%20-%20sindh%20Watersanitation%20for%20DG.pdf.


167. "Sindh Mobile Clinic Final Project Report - Real Medicine Foundation".


178. ibid


186. "KPK:(KPK Govt Completes 140 Clean Drinking Water Schemes) | Pakistan Press International". 

187. "Alarming Statistics: 50% Diseases In K-P Caused By Contaminated Water - The Express Tribune". 


190. "Rs432 Billion Disbursed In Agri-Credit Sector During First Half Of FY 2017-18 - Profit By Pakistan Today". 
Profit By Pakistan Today, Last modified 2018. 


194. "Results Yet To Be Seen: 'Some Of The Land Given To Peasants Was Largely Uncultivable' | The Express Tribune". 
The Express Tribune, Last modified 2013. 


196. "Sindh To Get A New And Improved Agriculture Policy | The Express Tribune". The Express Tribune, Last modified 2018. 

Underperformance: 🔴 Mixed performance: 🟡🟡 Progress: 🟢
Underperformance:  

Mixed performance:  

Progress:  


226. Ibid


241. Ibid